Translating Sherlock Holmes - the Case of "A Study in Scarlet"

Zebec, Daria

UNIVERSITY OF RIJEKA

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

DIVISION OF TRANSLATOLOGY

Daria Zebec

TRANSLATING SHERLOCK HOLMES – THE CASE OF "A STUDY IN SCARLET"

MASTER'S THESIS

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the M.A. in Translation studies at the University of Rijeka

Supervisor: assoc. prof. Antonija Primorac

Co-supervisor: assoc. prof. Petra Žagar-Šoštarić

Rijeka, September 2022

UNIVERSITY OF RIJEKA

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

Division of Translatology

Daria Zebec

JMBAG: 00090804797

Translating Sherlock Holmes – The Case Of "A Study in Scarlet"

MASTER'S THESIS

M.A. in Translation studies

Supervisor: assoc. prof. Antonija Primorac

Co-supervisor: assoc. prof. Petra Žagar-Šoštarić

Rijeka, September 2022

Authorship statement

I hereby declare that I am the author of this Master's thesis and have only used the indicated sources and aids.

Rijeka, _____ Signature _____

Abstract

As the first story about the now legendary detective Sherlock Holmes, “A Study in Scarlet” is widely considered a literary classic. Having been translated and retranslated continuously since it was first published in 1887, it is a valuable source when it comes to the comparison and evaluation of translations. However, while the novel celebrated much success in countries like Croatia, these translations have yet to be properly analyzed. The aim of this work is therefore to compare three Croatian and one German translation of “A Study in Scarlet”: “Kasna osveta” from 1908, “Späte Rache” from 1902, “Grimizna studija” from 1978, and “Grimizna nit” from 2013, in order to compare them not only to the source text, but also each other. Specifically, the focus is on the language and style in general, orthography, mistranslations, and influences from foreign languages. Ultimately, this work aims to provide an explanation as to why each of them are valuable texts, flaws and all.

Keywords: analysis, Croatian language, English language, German language, translation, literary translation

Contents

1. Introduction

Sherlock Holmes is perhaps one of the most recognizable fictional characters in the world today. The stories about the genius detective instantly captured audiences right from the very first story, “A Study in Scarlet” (1887). With such a legacy behind it, it is then no wonder that these stories have been translated and retranslated many times throughout the years. This thesis will first look at the early life of author Arthur Conan Doyle and the people and events that inspired the creation of the legendary detective. Then, it will explore what made “A Study in Scarlet” such a phenomenon by looking into its themes and how they connect to Victorian society, as well as look at potential difficulties in its translation. Finally, the main aim of this thesis is to analyze and compare three Croatian and one German translation of “A Study in Scarlet” from three time periods: “Kasna osveta” from 1908, “Späte Rache” from 1902, “Grimizna studija” from 1987, and “Grimizna nit” from 2013, in order to observe their differences and similarities, document which languages they were most influenced by, and evaluate their value in contemporary Sherlock translation.

2. Doyle's early life and the creation of Sherlock Holmes

Arthur Conan Doyle was born in Edinburgh in 1859 to a family with an artistic legacy. Namely, his grandfather and uncle were both well-known illustrators for magazines. His father, Charles Doyle, was an artist as well, mainly illustrating books, but never quite reached his full potential due to an alcohol problem. His addiction and metal health struggles only became worse with the years, until he had to be put in a sanatorium. Doyle's mother, Mary, was the one that took care of him and his siblings. They grew up poor, and financial troubles kept following Doyle throughout his life. Later in life he started caring for his brother. His mother was an avid reader, often reading while doing housework, which inspired Doyle to read as well (Sims 31).

Doyle had from a young age been curious about the world around him. As a boy he was engrossed by the heroic tales from Walter Scott, fascinated by the depictions of heroism and valor displayed in his works. He was also intrigued by the historical settings, and had an almost romantic view of the past (Sims 44). Another author who had an influence on him in his younger years was his favorite adventure novelist Jules Verne. As he learned French with the help of his books, he developed a thirst for adventure (Sims 31).

Perhaps the biggest literary inspirations behind Sherlock Holmes were Poe's Dupin and Gaboriau's Lecoq (Sims 131). Watson even compares Holmes to the two in "A Study in Scarlet", though the detective finds this insulting. The amateur detective Dupin depended on reasoning to solve crimes and claimed to be able to see right through people, but Poe did not provide any details about the process of his deduction**.** In contrast, Doyle decided his hero would flaunt his deduction skills by demonstrating them to the characters, and therefore also the reader (Sims 143). He was also influenced by the structure of Gaboriau's stories, in which the discovery of a crime is followed by an investigation, and then the author stepping in to

explain the events. The idea of the red thread, one of the central themes of "A Study in Scarlet", was also perhaps borrowed from "The Mystery of Orcival", which talked about the entangled skein that leads to the truth (Sims 123).

While he had an interest in arts and was well read from an early age, Doyle was also very sporty and always had a bit of a mischievous streak, which sometimes caused him problems. For example, while attending a school in Austria as a young boy, he got into trouble after publishing a sort of school newsletter in which he complained about the rules (Sims 36). His love of adventure and a never-ending curiosity about the world continued into adulthood. As a medical student he conducted an experiment on the effects of gelsemium by consuming increasing doses of the substance until he almost died. Notably, a character in "A Study in Scarlet" remarks that Sherlock Holmes would also have no qualms about testing a poison on himself. Later in life he also spent some time on the ocean as a doctor on a whaling boat, sometimes even joining in with the whalers as he was fond of blood sports. Later he boarded another ship, a cargo carrier that travelled to the west of Africa, and wrote a two-part article which was accompanied by photographs he took on the trip. He considered himself a sort of a bohemian, sometimes bragging and exaggerating his adventures in the letters he wrote home (Sims 68).

This bohemian nature might partially be what steered him towards spiritualism. He was raised Catholic, but the experiences he had faced as a doctor, many of which were painful and traumatic, had him questioning whether a benevolent God really existed (Sims 73). However, he was fascinated, almost obsessed with spiritualism. This makes for an amusing contrast: the educated author most known for creating a character who values logic above all believed that spirits could talk to the living.

While he was studying medicine at the University of Edinburgh, he met professor Joe Bell. Coming from a tradition of observant European physicians (much like his mentor James Syme) Bell wowed students with a theatrical routine in which he would diagnose a patient just by looking at them. He had a hawk-eye for small details which would help piece together the big picture. Doyle was fascinated not only by the deduction skills of his favorite professor, but also his compassionate approach to patients and kindness towards students (though this compassionate nature would not be incorporated into Sherlock Holmes). After he married and found more time to write, Doyle thought about how someone with the skills of his professor would go about solving crimes (Sims 124).

He had already made connections with the publishing world prior to that. He started taking his writing seriously once he settled in Portsmouth as a doctor. In the beginning he would write short stories, such as "The Veteran" or "The Captain of the Pole-Star", and send them out to weekly magazines. He often faced rejection, and even if the stories were accepted, the pay often was not up to par. However, his stories were eventually getting accepted by more prestigious weeklies and monthlies, and positive reviews soon followed. At this point in time, it was usual that authors in periodicals remained anonymous, and Doyle realized that this was a hindrance to his writing career as well as his earnings. A novel is what would truly put him on the map. His marriage with Touie, the sister of a former patient who had unfortunately passed away, is what brought him financial security, and he began writing the first Sherlock Holmes story.

"A Study in Scarlet" was completed in just six weeks (Sims 156). Rather proud of his work, he was disappointed when the manuscript kept getting rejected by publishers. This was partially because some publishers thought its length would make it difficult to serialize. He finally found success when he sent it to Ward, Lock & Company, a publisher of sensational popular novels. When an editor from Ward asked his wife's opinion on "A Study", she enthusiastically

answered that the author was a born novelist (Sims 159). Though Doyle was not overly enthusiastic over the house's proposed contract, he ultimately decided that he did not want his work to remain as a manuscript and agreed to the offer. Thus, Sherlock Holmes was finally introduced to the world in the short novel "A Study in Scarlet" in the 1887 issue of "Beeton's Christmas Annual" (Sims 160). The story was popular among readers and generally well-reviewed by critics. Readers were pulled in by the scientific detective who was able to make deductions from even the minutest of details and present his discoveries in such a way that they almost felt foolish for not having made those connections themselves (Sims 211).

Doyle successfully continued writing about Sherlock Holmes. In the span of just a couple of years he had become one of the most prominent writers of the time, interesting to both readers and publishers. It was also around this time that he put the medical profession behind him for good in order to completely focus on writing. Those who knew Joseph Bell could easily recognize parts of him in Sherlock. Doyle himself never forgot him, even dedicating "The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes" to his old teacher (Sims 212).

In brief, Arthur Conan Doyle was many things: an adventurer, an art lover, a doctor, a spiritualist, a scientist, a writer – and each of these aspects contributed to his creation of the character of Sherlock Holmes.

3. "A Study in Scarlet"

The story begins with retired army doctor John Watson coming to London, "that great cesspool into which all the loungers and idlers of the Empire are irresistibly drained" (Doyle 7). Due to the poor state of his finances, he is looking for a roommate, and through his old friend Stamford he gets introduced to the eccentric Sherlock Holmes, also looking to share rent with someone. Watson is amazed with Sherlock from their very first meeting, when he quickly and correctly deduces that he had been in Afghanistan, and they agree to share a flat at 221B, Baker Street. After they move in together, Watson only grows more intrigued with Sherlock, even writing down a list of his strengths and weaknesses before throwing it into the fire out of frustration. Only after their discussion of Sherlock's article on the art of deduction does he reveal his profession to Watson – he is a consulting detective, perhaps the only one in the world (Doyle 28).

Sherlock soon gets the opportunity to demonstrate what it means to be a consulting detective when he is called to help solve the murder of Enoch Drebber. After examining the body and the bloody inscription of "RACHE" in what is the first use of a magnifying glass in detective fiction (Sweeney 3), he is quickly able to deduce the murderer's sex, age, height, and appearance, as well as the victim's cause of death – poison. Later, he and Watson talk to a witness who claims to have seen a drunkard near the scene of the crime. Sherlock immediately deduces that this must have been the murderer, and when Watson asks why the perpetrator would return, he answers that it must have been because of the ring. He swears he will catch the criminal in a monologue from which the title of the novel is drawn:

> I might not have gone but for you, and so have missed the finest study I ever came across: a study in scarlet, eh? Why shouldn't we use a little art jargon? *There's the*

> *scarlet thread of murder running through the colorless skein of life*, and our duty is to unravel it, and isolate it, and expose every inch of it. (Doyle 59, emphasis added)

Sherlock places an ad in the newspaper advertising the wedding ring from the scene in the hope of luring the perpetrator. This proves successful when a crone soon arrives at the flat to retrieve it. Sherlock is suspicious of her and gives chase. He fails to catch up with her, ultimately concluding that it was not an old woman after all, but rather a young man and accomplice of the murderer (Doyle 71).

The next day Scotland Yard's detective Gregson visits Baker Street and brags that he has solved the case. He suspects the son of the landlady where Drebber was staying along with his secretary Strangerson. As he is explaining his theory, they are interrupted by fellow detective Lestrade who informs them that Strangerson has also been killed, with another "Rache" inscription left at the scene. Sherlock is confident that the pills found in Strangerson's hotel room are the final piece of the puzzle. He lets a sick dog try both pills, and when the dog dies after the second one, they discover that one of them was poisonous and the other was not. Soon after, a cabman arrives at the flat and Sherlock unveils his identity – "let me introduce you to Mr. Jefferson Hope, the murderer of Enoch Drebber and of Joseph Stangerson" (Doyle 98).

This ends the first part of the novel. While the first part follows Watson's perspective as he writes down the events in his journal, the second part is told in 3rd person and follows the events which eventually lead to Hope's crime. John and Lucy Ferrier are wandering through the Utah dessert. The rest of their companions have died, but the two of them are saved by a group of Mormons, under the condition that they convert to the religion. Years after, Ferrier is a respected member of the community while Lucy is given the nickname "the flower of Utah" for her beauty (Doyle 131). She is to be married off as yet another wife, as is Mormon custom,

to an elder's son, and is given 29 days to make the choice between the sons of two powerful community members: Drebber and Stangerson. However, both John and Lucy strongly oppose this. Not only are they appalled by polygamy, but Lucy is also in love with a young man named Jefferson Hope. Numbers counting down the days she has left to choose between Drebber and Stangerson start appearing in their house, and they call for Hope to help them. Hope arrives just before the last day and they attempt to make an escape, but the Mormons kill Ferrier and Lucy is forced to marry Drebber. She dies soon after, and Hope makes it his lifelong goal to get revenge on him and Strangerson. This is how he ends up in London after a long chase around Europe.

The narrative then switches back to Watson' perspective as he details the aftermath of Hope getting caught. He is escorted to the police station and reveals that he is suffering from a heart condition that could kill him any second. Because of this, he does not hesitate to admit to the murders and describes the motivation behind his actions in detail.

After twenty years he finally managed to come face to face with Drebber and acted as his cab driver and drove him to the abandoned house. There he presented him with a box with two pills and told him to choose one. He chose this method to prove to both Drebber and himself that justice will ultimately prevail (Doyle 175). Drebber died from the poison while Hope mockingly held Lucy's wedding ring in front of him. He wrote "Rache" on the walls to confuse the police. However, after leaving the house he realized he lost Lucy's ring. He continued to look for Strangerson. When he found him in his hotel room he presented him with the pills, but when Strangerson attacked him, he stabbed him instead. Finally, when Sherlock asks who came to retrieve the ring, he admits it was him.

Hope dies from an aneurism the night before his trial and has a smile on his face when his body is found. Back at Baker Street, Sherlock explains the train of thought that lead him to

Jefferson Hope. However, the newspapers give all the credit to Gregson and Lestrade. Watson assures Sherlock that the public will find out about his contributions, as he has the truth written down in his journal.

* * *

This story singlehandedly created the myth of the private detective that persists until today. One of the reasons why it resonated with its readers so much was because it played into the Victorian fear of urban crime, exacerbated by the urban explosion and the terrors that followed, such as the brutal killings at the hand of Jack the Ripper just a year after the novel's publication (McConnell 174). Along with the fear of crime came a general fear of social change, the paranoia about social revolutions that were brewing at the time, and so the mention of political extremists also plays a minor role in in "A Study in Scarlet".

The Mormons are another topical Victorian concern included in the novel. The group had been notorious since its founding, particularly because of their practice of polygamy. This restoration of archaic religious practices caused panic, the main worry of the British being that established religious structures would be destroyed (Lacourt 91). In "A Study" this fear only becomes stronger because this kind of horror from abroad makes its way back to England.

With the threats of social change looming over the horizon, Sherlock Holmes was a figure that instilled a sense of security, a reassurance that evildoers would get caught and order restored. A reassurance that the universe is comprehensible after all, and that reason will prevail in the end (McConnell 178). It also helped that trust in the police was low, adding to the appeal of an unorthodox figure like Sherlock, who works to protect the system, while also being an outcast in it (Clausen 114). While the urban explosion offered a new sense of anonymity, it is his job to see through it and assign a name to a perpetrator like Hope, who believed no one would go looking for him (Fillimgham 670).

Translating a work that is so much of its time, both in terms of themes and language, can be a daunting task. The fact that it is such a well-known novel and that many of the staples of detective fiction stem from it adds additional pressure. The translator has to be familiar with the archaic terms, be flexible when it comes to writing styles (specifically, Watson's entries vs. third person narration in the middle section), while also not straying too far from the original in an attempt to modernize it. With that, let us take a look at the first Croatian translation of "A Study in Scarlet" and see what issues the translator struggled with.

4. “Kasna osveta”

“Kasna osveta” is a 1908 Croatian translation of “A Study in Scarlet” published by Gjuro Trpinac. At least partially translated from the German “Späte Rache” (1902), it was part of a series of Sherlock Holmes stories called “Detektiv Sherlock Holmes i njegovi znameniti doživljaji” (eng. lit. Detective Sherlock Holmes and His Famous Adventures; German original: Detectiv Sherlock Holmes und seine weltberühmten Abenteuer) that also included translations of pastiches written by Kurt Matull and Theo von Blankensee (Primorac 2022). The publishing house of the German pastiches was sued by Doyle’s copyright holder, which lead to the series removing the name “Sherlock Holmes” from the titles (now changing it to the more general “Aus den Geheimakten des Welt-Detektivs”, meaning “From the notebooks of World Detectives”), though it was still used in the texts (Ritzheimer 2016). No translator has been credited. It should be noted that we might refer to this translation as Croatian today.

The problems with this translation start right from the very title. The original title, “A Study in Scarlet”, in a way represents Sherlock’s mission statement – to expose and solve the mysteries and monstrosities that occur in our seemingly regular lives (Doyle 59). It is also art jargon, where a study is a sketch that artists make to practice certain elements before applying it to the main piece (“What’s an art study?”). This reference reveals how Sherlock approaches his work – to him, deduction is an art form. By comparison, “Kasna osveta” (literally “A Late / Belated Revenge”) does not tell us much about the character. It instead alludes to the killer’s motive, which takes away from some of the mystery. The translator could have chosen the Croatian “študija u crvenu” (24) instead. However, the translator might have decided that a more sensationalist title would pull in more readers, in keeping with the sensationalist tone of the series of penny dreadful pastiches in which it came out.

One interesting aspect of this translation is that it was written while new Sherlock Holmes stories were still being published. One could assume that this makes this translation more accurate than those written in future years, as it does not make any attempts to modernize or update the language of the text. However, this also means that a contemporary Croatian reader would not understand parts of it, or would consider some parts to sound unnatural.

Take, for example, the frequent use of the archaic past tense of *aorist*. To illustrate just how frequently it is used: "Sastadosmo se sutradan, kao što uglavismo i pogledasmo sobe na broj 221. b. Baker-street, o kojima mi je govorio." (7). In a contemporary translation, these verbs would probably be in the now more commonly used past tense *perfekt*. Another element that indicates that the text was not written in contemporary times is the combination of a modal verb, the particle "da", and another verb, for example: "treba da prouči" (10), "ne može da bude" (15), "nije mogao da crkne" (37). Today the more acceptable form would be that of a modal verb and the infinitive of the verb, such as "treba proučiti" or "ne može biti".

The text is not only dated in terms of grammar. Many of the terms used are also archaic. This can present a significant problem in cases where the same term now holds a different meaning. For instance, "violin" is translated as "gusle" (9), which makes Sherlock a "guslač" (6). This might have been an appropriate translation for the time – "Rječnik hrvatskoga ili srpskoga jezika" from 1890 notes that writers use the word "guslač" to refer to a person playing any sort of string instrument (508) – but today gusle refers to a simple traditional instrument with one string, a sort of fiddle (Hrvatski jezični portal). This is a notable change since the associations that come with these two instruments are very different. In the original he can play many pieces on this sophisticated instrument, but would sometimes also strum it absentmindedly as an outlet for his emotions (Doyle 24). This can be interpreted as a symbol of his refined, yet unconventional mind. In contrast, "gusle" – like the fiddle – is an instrument primarily associated with "regular" people, folk music and "simple" entertainment, and the

symbolism is lost. This translation probably stems from a reliance on the lexic and tradition of oral literature, which is discrepancy with famous illustrations of Sherlock playing the violin.

Further examples of archaisms include: “drug” for “fellow”, ”companion” and “colleague”, “melem” for “plaster” (14), “držati” for “think” (67), “dočim” (10) for “while” etc. Most of them can be replaced with a modern equivalent without much issue, for example, “prijatelj”, “flaster”, “misliti”.

Another element that would probably catch the contemporary reader’s eye is the outdated spelling. One of the differences from contemporary Croatian orthography that appears most frequently is “ie” where we would today write “ije”, for example “rieka” (40), “bliedo” (41), “liečnik” (11) etc. Iotation also seemed to not have been part of the orthography yet: “dodjosmo” (22), “sidje” (35), “rodjen” (52) etc. Consonant devoicing is another alternation not present in the translation: “izkrcah” (2), “izkrivljeno” (16), “uzko” (43). A further peculiarity is that the translator in some cases avoids using the letter “y”, instead transcribing it to the Croatian phonetic equivalent “j”: “Jellowstone” (40), “Brigham Joung” (42), “nevjorska policija” (67), “Jork-College” (66). This might be because readers of the time were not as familiar with the English language and might not have known how to pronounce this letter. However, the translator is not consistent with this, as the “y” gets to stay in “New-York” (67).

“Jork-College” also exemplifies one of the main particularities of this translation, namely, the influence of the German language. The sentence structures are a clear indication of this, as they are often left in their original “dass” form. A clause using the conjunction “dass” is a subordinate clause connected to the main clause with a comma, with the verb at the end. For example, original sentence – “That comes of being an unofficial personage.” (36), translation – “Tome je uzrok, što ja nisam služben čovjek” (14), German structure that the

translation was possibly modeled after – “Das liegt daran, dass ich eine nichtamtliche Person bin”. “Pošto ste mi se vi tužili, što nemate sustanara” (also an example of a temporal conjunction used as a causal conjunction) – “Da Sie sich mir beschert haben, *dass*…”, “Dobro je, da jedan drugoga upoznamo sa svojim zlim stranama” – “Es ist gut, *dass*…”…

While the actual German translation from 1902 entitled “Späte Rache” uses different structures than those in the example German sentences above, the use of the comma before “što” shows that the translator indeed had German grammar in mind while translating. This comma separating the subordinate clauses also appears in other types of sentences, such as “Vi kažete, da se okrećemo okolo Sunca.” (9), which was “Sie sagen, die Erde dreht sich um die Sonne” in “Späte Rache”, further indicating the influence of German. More examples of these structures include: “Bez sumnje bi onaj čovjek bio obješen, da je onda postajao onaj način iztraživanja” (6) – “Ohne Zweifel wäre er gehängt worden, *wenn*…”,

The influence of German goes beyond just the sentence structure. In some cases, the verb tenses are also more reminiscent of German than the English original. Take for example this sentence: “(…) dokaz, da je borba sa smrću morala žestoka biti.” (16). Once again the “dass” structure was kept in the translation, and on top of that “morala žestoka biti” is very similar to “gewesen sein musste” – the *Futur II* form of the verb “sein” plus the modal verb “müssen”. The German sentence that the translator might have been thinking of while translating could be along the lines of “ (…) Beweis, dass der Kampf mit dem Tod heftig gewesen sein musste.”, while the original is “(…) as though his death-struggle had been a grievous one.” (Doyle 41), though this could also be an example of a stylistically marked word order. Of course, this translation is not incorrect, but some of the original text’s flair is certainly lost through this process of indirect translation. However, with this example we are once again faced with the question of why this very German-sounding structure was used, when “Späte Rache” itself translates this section differently: “die Fäuste geballt und die Beine fest

übereinander geschlagen, wahrscheinlich im Todeskampf" – in this case it only describes the position of his limbs and says that he must have ended up that way while fighting death. It says nothing about the death being grievous, eliminating that part of the clause entirely.

Some words also seem to be translated literally. One instance of literal translation is the the sentence "Moram priznati, da ja ovo sve nikako ne mogu dovesti u savez." (21). Again we have the structure of a sentence with "dass", while the phrase "dovesti u savez" is very similar to the German "in Verbindung bringen". Other examples include the sentence "ne pozna Kopernikovu teoriju" (8). While the source says that he was "ignorant" of the theory, this solution seems to again be taken directly from the German form "nicht kennen".

Another characteristic of German that stayed in the translation is the frequent use of *Komposita* or compound nouns consisting of a root word preceded by modifiers which describe it. The *Komposita* are translated as semi-compounds, with the translator adding a dash to indicate where the modifier and root word are separated. The most common *Komposita* translations in this text are street names, toponyms, and locations: "Duncan-ulica" (28), "Alkali-ravnica" (40), "Wahsatch-gora" (46), "Hallidays Private-Hotel" (34), etc, as well as some items – "Albert-lanac" (17). In "Späte Rache", those locations are referred to as "Dunkanstraße", "Alkali-Ebene", "Wahsatch-Gebirge", and "Hallidays Privathotel". Interestingly, the translations of street names tend to be rather inconsistent. The previously mentioned "Duncan-ulica" also gets translated as "Duncanova ulica" (27), an adaption closer to Croatian grammar, while Camberwell Road stays "Camerwellroad" (31), with the space between words left out. Brixton Road is translated three different ways throughout the book; first it stays as a *Komposita* – "Brixton-street" (15), then the dash is removed, and it turns into "Brixtonstreet" (22), before the translator finally settles for "Brixtonov put" (27), which is used for the rest of the novel. There are also some exceptions where the entire name is translated,

for example, “Lauristonov Park” (14) for “Lauriston Gardens” (Doyle 35), though those examples are much rarer.

There are more examples of toponyms and locations where all elements are translated into Croatian like with Brixtonov put, but it seems the translator did not follow any specific rule when to apply such translations. For example, Kriterijon-krčma is left as a *Komposita* but the bar White Hart is translated into “K bielom jelenu” (22), mirroring the German “Weißer Hirsch”. Similarly, Eagle Ravine and Eagle Cañon are translated to “Orlov Timor” (56) and “orlov klanac” (57).

It also seems that the rules for declension of foreign proper nouns either were not yet properly established at the time this translation was written, or have changed since then. This can be observed with the names. The name “Rachel” is changed into accusative case: “(…) nemojte gubiti uzalud vrieme, tražeći gospodjicu Rachelu” (Doyle 20). Alice is turned into “Alica” (33), and also used in vocative case: “Možda bi bilo bolje, Alico, da nas ostaviš na samu” (32). According to current grammar rules those names would have stayed in their original form.

Other proper names are translated into their Croatian equivalents. Lucy Ferrier became Lucija (45), Joseph Strangerson became Josip (53), and Johnny Hones went through quite a big change and turned into Ivanka (41). This is a particularly odd case. Not only did the name itself get translated, but the character’s gender was also changed for seemingly no reason. Interestingly, the name of the real-life founder of the Mormons, Joseph Smith, is also translated: Josip Smith (45). In what seems to be a common thread in this translation, the translation of names is inconsistent. Names like Sherlock probably stayed the same because of the lack of a Croatian equivalent, but then how come John stays, while Johnny gets a translation? In contemporary translations all these names would have most likely stayed in their

original form, since the general rule today is that only names from classical languages or names of certain historical, literary, and religious figures be translated (e.g. Plato – *Platon*, Romeo and Juliet – *Romea i Julija*, George I – *Đuro I.*, etc.).

While many of these translations are questionable but not incorrect, there are also some examples where the translator simply missed the mark. Right at the beginning of the book Watson describes being saved by his orderly, Murray (Doyle 6). Here, "orderly" refers to an assistant hospital worker. In the translation however, Murray is instead a servant (2). This might have been a result of a misunderstanding stemming from the German. In "Späte Rache", for example, the original term used was *Bursche*. However, *Bursche* can also literally mean young boy. So, the translator might have seen the phrase "mein Bursche", interpreted it as "my boy", and then assumed Murray was a servant.

A further rather big misstep occurs in this part of the book: "I consider that a man's brain originally is something like a little empty attic, and you have to stock it with such furniture as you choose" (Doyle 21). Instead of "tavan", the translator goes with "škrinja". This could again be a misinterpretation of the German translation where the word "Dachkammer" was used, as this word can refer to a small room or pantry. This blunder then fails to convey Sherlock's metaphor – he goes on to talk about stocking the attic with the right furniture and not just any lumber, and reminding that the room does not have elastic walls. The translator changes furniture and lumber to items, yet leaves in the elastic walls even when they don't quite make sense for a trove. (8)

Interestingly, the translator also makes the choice to translate "a four of gin" (56) to "rakija" (22). This is curious since rakija is a drink specific to the Balkans. This example, along with the previously discussed "gusle", shows that the translator had a tendency to adapt culturally terms for Croatian readers.

Next, let us look at the sentence “Beating the subjects!” (Doyle 11), which is for some reason translated as “Batinom po životinjama!” (4). This mistake then extends to the next sentence, where the meaning is completely changed: “Yes; to verify how far bruises may be produced after death” (Doyle 11). Of course, checking animals for bruises does not make much sense, so the translator adjusted his solution to match the previous mistake: “Da; da vidi koliko trzaja može životinja učiniti kad nastupi smrt.” (4)

Some of the mistakes also seem to come from a lack of knowledge of the subject matter. The translation of the following sentence is a good example of this problem: “It was a warm June morning, and the Latter-Day Saints were as busy as the bees whose hives they have chosen for their emblem.” (Doyle 120). The translator seems not to have realized that “Latter-Day Saints” refers to the Mormons. He then reconstructs the sentence to try and make sense of it and leaves a part out. The result is confusing: “Bio je topli dan lipnja mjeseca i zadnji dan svetaca. Sve je bilo zaposleno poput pčela, koje se spremaju na roj” (47). The text also includes some peculiar minor mistakes, such as Watson’s list of Sherlock’s abilities combining Botany and Geology. Because of this, Watson makes 12 bullet points in the source (Doyle 28), but only 11 in “Kasna osveta” (9).

With “A Study in Scarlet” being one of the first examples of detective fiction, the translator had the difficult task of translating terms which are now staples of the genre into Croatian for the very first time. Take Sherlock’s signature technique of “deduction”, for example. The translator seems to have been unsure what to do with this word. He chooses to translate the verb form as “izvesti”, for example, when a stunned Watson asks “Kako ste, za Boga, mogli izvesti to?” (13). Similarly, the deductions from Sherlock’s “The Book of Life” are translated as “izvadjenje” (10). The act of drawing deductions, however, is a different story: “Stadoh razmišljati o ovom našem kratkom razgovoru i pokušah da *povučem* iz njegovih rieči *posljedice*.” (9, emphasis added). However, when it is clear that Sherlock is talking specifically

about his approach to deduction, the translator choses “Pravila dedukcije” (11), perhaps as a way to differentiate it from its everyday meaning. A further staple of detective fiction are clues. While a contemporary translation would probably likely use “trag”, in this text the term “ključ” is used instead (24). This also changes the meaning, as “ključ” is a more general term – to find the key to the mystery means to find the root of the mystery, making it seem as if it is the single decisive piece of the puzzle. The term clue, on the other hand, indicates that a finding is simply one of the puzzle pieces, which will then be used to chain the events together to uncover the secrets behind the mystery. Those familiar with detective fiction would likely immediately understand what “clue” or “trag” specifically indicates, while “key” or “ključ” is more ambiguous.

Interestingly, while the influence of German on this translation is undeniable, what with the terms and sentence structures which clearly are not Croatian in nature, it does not seem that this text was translated solely from the already existing 1902 “Späte Rache”. Some of the evidence pointing to this is the fact that certain parts of “A Study in Scarlet” are missing in “Späte Rache”, but are present in “Kasna osveta”. “Späte Rache”, for example, does not mention the Criterion bar at all, instead Watson meets Stamford on the street, but “Kasna osveta” does mention “Kriterijon-krčma”, and in *Komposita* form too. Moreover, the mistranslated section on Sherlock beating dead bodies is completely missing from “Späte Rache” but, again, does appear in “Kasna osveta”.

There are multiple possible explanations as to what is going on here. For one, it is possible that the translator was cross-referencing the German translation with the English source text, and therefore noticed some parts that were missing, adding them back where needed. This would explain why even the names of locations which do not appear in the German version are still in *Komposita* form, and why the titles of the two translations are exactly the same, neither following the titling scheme of the source. Additionally, it could also

explain where “Ivanka” came from. In “Späte Rache”, this character’s name is “Johanny”, which is very similar to Johanna, the German equivalent of Ivanka.

The second option is that there were multiple translators working on this translation, possibly from different sources. This would explain why certain terms are translated differently throughout the book – recall the examples of “Brixtonov put”, “dedukcija” and names which sometimes got translated, and sometimes not. However, this is difficult to either confirm or deny as the identity of the translator(s) is unknown. Thirdly, there is also the possibility that the translator used a different edition of “Späte Rache” altogether.

All in all, “Kasna osveta” is a charming yet flawed first attempt at translating “A Study in Scarlet”. The obvious influence of German, many archaic terms, and plenty inconsistencies may not make for an overall high-quality translation. However, they all come together to give an insight into the practice of hurried, somewhat careless, Sherlock Holmes translations that came out in cheap penny dreadfuls typical for the late 19th and early 20th century literary production. For this reason, and because it was the first introduction to Sherlock Holmes for many Croatian readers, this text is still valuable even more than a hundred years after its publication.

5. "Späte Rache"

The German translation "Späte Rache" was published as the first part of a series of Sherlock Holmes books in 1902 by German publishing company Robert Lutz. This company also published many other Doyle novels and short stories, as well as pastiches. Once again, no translator is credited.

Just like with "Kasna osveta", the translation of the title is completely different than the source text, which means it has the same issues as those discussed in the previous section. However, in this case it is a bit clearer why this title was chosen over the title translation of "A Study in Scarlet" – namely, the entire paragraph of Sherlock using art jargon to illustrate his mission as a detective is missing from the work, and it would therefore not make any sense to base the title of the book on it. This section is not missing in "Kasna osveta", yet the title remains the same, meaning that in the Croatian translator must have looked to this German translation when choosing the title. However, this also raises another question: why is this part missing in the first place?

This is not the only section omitted from the German translation. In some cases, parts of a sentence and even entire paragraphs are missing. For example, references to the framing device of Watson's journal entry are removed twice in chapter two. "The reader may set me down as a hopeless busybody…" (Doyle 20), for example, is omitted for a more general "Kein Wunder, daß meine Neugier in hohem Grade rege war…" ("No wonder my curiosity was high"), as is "I see that I have alluded above to his powers on the violin." (Doyle 24).

Moreover, many cultural references are also missing. For example, the "fatal battle of Maiwand" (Doyle 6) is simply referred to as the first battle, Henri Murger's "Vie de Boheme" (Doyle 69) is simply referred to as a French novel. The paragraph of Sherlock talking about Darwin's theories on music (Doyle 62) is missing entirely, as is any reference to the book *De*

Jure inter Gentes which Sherlock mentions to Watson (Doyle 66). Furthermore, when Watson reads newspaper excerpts speculating about the motive behind the case, certain elements are again omitted, for example the entire section mentioning "the Vehmgericht, aqua tofana, Carbonari, the Marchioness de Brinvillers, the Darwinian theory, the principles of Malthus and the Ratcliff Highway murders" (Doyle 72). The title of chapter three was changed from "The Lauriston Gardens Mystery" to "Brixtonstraße Nummer drei" and Lauriston Gardens are not mentioned at all, and neither is the street The Strand. The Roman miser at the end of the book is also missing in its entirety. The translator might have done this in order to simplify the text for the readers, intentionally excluding any references the reader might not be familiar with. Alternatively, the translator might have not been familiar with them either and chose to simply skip them.

However, in the case of the conundrum surrounding the bloody "Rache", omission proved to be a useful tool for the translator. The confusion around the name Rachel and the German *Rache* would, of course, not be entirely obvious to German readers. There are multiple ways the translator could have dealt with this, for example, using footnotes to provide an explanation. However, the translator chose to remove any mention of the name Rachel, making it seem as if the writing said "revenge" in the source text. For the sake of consistency, Sherlock's theory on why the word could not have been written by a German (Doyle 53) is then also omitted.

This is not the only example of the translator editing and adjusting the text for German readers. Some examples of smaller-scale adjustments include: Watson's bull-pup is turned into a *Bullenbeißer*, which is a now-extinct breed of German bulldog. Similarly, the sick terrier is instead a dachshund. Drebber tells Mrs. Charpentier's daughter that she will live like a *Fürstin* if she marries him (rather than a princess), while whiskey and gin are both translated as *Grog.*

Some names are also translated into German; for example, *Josef* Smith and *Bruder Bertel* (brother Bob in the source text). As for Alice Charpentier, in this translation her name is Mary. There does not seem to be apparent reason for this change, and it also could not have come from a simple retranslation of "Alice", like in the example of Bertel. Salt Lake City is referred to as "Stadt am Salzsee" and "Salzsestadt". However, those terms do not seem to be specific only to this translation. Searching for the term on Google Books shows that Salt Lake City was called this way in many German language texts from the mid-to-late 1800s, for example "Fortschritte der Physik" from 1871 (21) and "Die Allgemeine Auswanderungs-Zeitung" from 1864 (125) both refer to it as "Salzseestadt".

As the previously mentioned examples show, street names are in *Komposita* form, but interestingly, there is a lack of consistency as to the spelling, which was mirrored in "Kasna osveta". For example, Baker Street is translated as both "Bakerstraße" and "Baker-Straße" in different parts of the book, just like "Brixtonstreet" and "Brixton-Street" in "Kasna Osveta"

The spelling in this text is mostly in line with modern German, with two exceptions. Firstly, no capital *Umlaut* letters such as Ü or Ä are used, instead they are always written as such: Uebung, Ueberlegenheit, Ueber, Aehnliches, Aeußere, Aeltesten, Aerger, Oeffnen… Secondly, words with the verb *tun* (do) as a root are spelt with an *h* unlike in contemporary German, for example: das thut nichts, Thatsachen, Thatsächliches, Unthat, Thatkraft… Other words, such as Thür and Thal also feature the extra *h.*

Just like "Kasna osveta", this translation also has some problems with the translation of deduction. Chapter two, for example, is titled "Die Kunst der Schlußfolgerung", and "rules of deduction" is translated as "Uebung der Schlußfolgerung". However, when Sherlock talks about the science of deduction later in the chapter, it is translated as "Studium der Deduktion", a distinction which was also made in "Kasna osveta".

The translator also seems to have struggled with the translations of “detective” and “Scotland Yard”. The term “Scotland Yard” does not appear in the translation at all. Depending on the context, it is translated as “Polizeimannschaft” (police team) or “Geheimpolizisten” (secret police). Meanwhile, “detective work” is translated as “Arbeit der Geheimpolizisten” (work of the secret police), and detective as either “Detektiv” or “Polizist” (police officer).

There are also some minor mistakes in the translation, such as the village Netley being referred to as Nelley and the name McGregor being changed to just Gregor.

Overall, “Späte Rache” is an interesting part of Sherlock translation history. The omissions of many parts of the book are sometimes understandable, such as in the case of Rache, which would not be a very convincing twist for German readers. In other cases, however, omissions also take away some vital moments in the story, like the part about the scarlet thread that the entire novella was named after. Additionally, some terms and names are germanised, including that of historical figures like Joseph Smith, which can also be confusing. Just like “Kasna osveta”, this translation also has a problem with inconsistent naming (most notably, for example, the unexplainable switch from Alice to Mary). Also inconsistent is the translation of “deduction” and terminology relating to detectives. Similarly to “Kasna osveta”, it was probably translated quickly and without too much care, resulting in unique and interesting quirks worthy of studying.

6. “Grimizna studija”

“Grimizna studija” was published in Zagreb in 1978. As opposed to “Kasna osveta”, it has credited translators: Ružica and Aleksandar Vlaškalin, who have also worked on translations of “The Sign of Four” and “The Hound of Baskerville”. Another factor which differentiates it from the previous translation is that it was most likely translated from the original English, and not German. Additionally, as it was published in Yugoslavia, the translation therefore follows the rules of the current grammars of Serbo-Croatian, which means we are faced with the complex issue surrounding the identity of this language.

Unlike the 1908 translation, which took a more liberal approach to the translation of the title, the Vlaškalin duo left it unchanged. We can also use it to observe the way the language changed since then – the *š* is dropped from “študia” (which reflects the lessening impact of the German language, where *st* is read as *št*), and the “crveno” is replaced with “grimizno”, which could be seen as a sign of more careful word choices. While this translation is more accurate, better reflects the main theme of the story and avoids spoiling the motive behind the killing, it still sounds somewhat unnatural, as it does not resolve the problem of the word “studij” not being associated with art studies in modern Croatian. However, the last point might not have been a problem at the time of publishing, since “university” is translated as “univerzitet” (9).

Published 70 years after “Kasna osveta”, the language is generally much closer to modern Croatian. The *aorist* is used noticeably less frequently, mostly replaced by *perfekt*. Compare to the same sentence from “Kasna osveta”: “Slijedećeg dana našli smo se kako smo se dogovorili i pogledali sobe, o kojima mi je pričao prilikom našeg sustreta, u Baker Streetu br. 221” (17). The combination of the verb and particle *da* is also much rarer, but not entirely gone, and is here also used with regular verbs. For example: “Što je imao da ispriča John Rance” (38), “hoću da stignem” (40), “naumih da krenem” (41). The orthography is also much

more contemporary, with the *ije*, iotation and consonant devoicing we are used to today – "liječnik" (9), "dođete" (89), "ispriča" (90). The letter *y* is also not replaced by *j* anymore – "Yellowstone" (75). In other cases, the spelling of certain words is phonetic and would today be considered outdated: for example, "Evropa" (65).

The names of characters remain untranslated and are declined properly: Lucy Ferrier (86), Joseph Smith (84). In the case of Rachel, the translators feel the need to add the Croatian version of the name, Rahela, in brackets (35), in other cases the name is misspelled "gospođa Sawyery" (50). But overall, this approach to names remains consistent throughout the entire book, with one exception – Johnny Hones is renamed to Jean Hones (78). Curiously, this character's name was also translated as "Ivanka" in "Kasna osveta", suggesting that this translation might have used the older ones as a reference point. It is possible that the translators did not have access to or did not check the English source text when translating this part. They might have, for example, come across "Ivanka" and decided to change it to English since none of the other character's names are translated either, and then decided on a name they thought fit best.

Just like the characters, the names of locations mostly remain untranslated, for example, Brixton Road stays Brixton Road (29). However, the translators sometimes also take liberties to adjust the names to Croatian, for example, the Alkali Plain (which is not a concrete geographical location, but rather a descriptor, therefore allowing for a more relaxed approach to translation) is referred to as "Slana pustinja" (75), and the White Hart as "Bijeli jelen" (41). Though the *Komposita* from the previous translation are mostly gone, the traces of German influence can still be found in instances such as "Criterion-bar" (10), which is the second clue that might lead us to wonder whether "Kasna osveta" might have been referenced in the process of this translation.

We can observe that more care was put into this translation than into "Kasna osveta" by comparing its mistranslations to the solutions by the Vlaškalins: Murray is a "posilni" (9); Sherlock's metaphor of the brain as an empty attic remains intact ("držim da je čovječji mozak u početku jedna malena prazna *potkrovnica* u koju treba nagomilati namještaj po svom izboru" (19, emphasis added)); Sherlock does not beat animals, but rather "udara po *leševima*" (12, emphasis added).

This translation is also superior when it comes to transferring the meanings of idioms. For example, the phrase "They are as sharp as needles" (Doyle 75) is translated to "oštri su kao igla" in "Kasna osveta" (30), which is certainly not incorrect, but "bistri su kao suza" (55) sounds much more natural in Croatian. Other examples which show the translators were not scared to play around with the translation and transfer meaning-for-meaning, rather than word-for-word are: "Tu je skoro zapao u ćorsokak" (23) for "He got himself into a fog recently" (Doyle 29), "ispada da stara metla ipak najbolje mete" (35) for "the old hound is the best" (Doyle 46) and "Obradit ću taj slučaj za svoj groš" (29) for "I shall work it out on my own hook." (Doyle 36).

While many of the archaisms from "Kasna osveta" are updated (for example, "plaster" is "flaster" rather than "melem"), the translation includes many of what would today be considered out of date terms, largely influenced by the Serbo-Croat as standardized in post World War 2 Yugoslavia. Take, for example, "matora" (59) for old girl, "keceljica" (77) for apron, or "mart" (21) for March.

Some contemporary readers may also consider certain terms outdated, for example, "hulja Drebber" (61) for "scoundrel Drebber" (Doyle 83), "zvekan" (47) for "dunderhead" (Doyle 64), "Hvali se i kočoperi" (26) for "Brag and bounce!" (Doyle 32), "…ali da je netko tako *nakresan* kao što je bio taj *prikan*, to još nisam vidio" (43, emphasis added) for "but never

any one so cryin' drunk as that cove". The text also includes some awkward translations, such as "nosač sa željeznice u svojoj uniformi s pregačom od čohe" (21) for "railway porter in his velveteen uniform" (Doyle 25), and "dok smo se kotrljali na kotačima" (10).

"Deduction" is once again translated multiple ways. In this translation, Watson asks "Otkud to znate, zaboga?" (13), while chapter two is titled "Nauka o zaključivanju", and the rules of deduction are "zakoni zaključivanja" (24). Similarly to "Kasna osveta", the translation is different depending on whether the term is used specifically in relation to Sherlock's skillset or in a more general meaning. It is again worth noting that the translators made an effort to make the term sound more natural in Croatian rather than simply leaving it as "dedukcija". The term "clue" is also translated in different ways, rather than the expected "trag", such as "ključ" (44) and "putokaz" (68). In other instances, the translators avoid using the term entirely, instead reconstructing the sentence, for example: "And how did you get your clue?" (Doyle 77) turns into "A kako ste vi riješili ovu zagonetku?" (56), and "Did you find nothing in the room which could furnish a clue to the murderer?" (Doyle 90) turns into "Zar ništa niste našli u sobi, što bi nam moglo olakšati put do ubojice?" (65). This is curious, as this translation was published a whole 100 years after the source text, meaning the translators should have been familiar with such detective fiction staples, especially since they also worked on other Sherlock translations.

There are also some translation choices in "Grimizna studija" that stray from the original meaning or are incomplete. For example, John Ferrier describes Jefferson Hope as follows: "He's a likely lad, and he's a Christian, which is more than these folks here, in spite o' all their praying and preaching." (Doyle 133). This is simply translated as "On je pošten i zgodan momak" (95). Other references to Christianity are not omitted in the translation, so this instance is quite peculiar – "ruka Gospodinova" (98), "Reci, da li je bog stvorio i ovu zemlju?" (78), "Mi smo progonjena djeca božja, izaslanci anđela Merona." (82).

To sum up, “Grimizna studija” manages to avoid many of the problems from “Kasna osveta”. For one, it is probably translated from English rather than German, though some of its influences might have been carried over from previous translations, so it avoids mistakes from indirect translation and stays closer to the source text. As the Sherlock Holmes stories were already considered classics at the time of its publication, the translators also put more care and effort into their work. This is obvious from the way they translate idioms meaning-for-meaning rather than word-for-word. However, contemporary readers might find some of the now obsolete expressions from mid-century Serbo-Croat distracting. On top of that, the translation does not provide a concrete solution when it comes to terms often used in detective fiction, such as “deduction” or “clues”. In other words, while “Grimizna studija” is certainly an improvement on prior translations, but it still contains a number of flaws that need to be ironed out when it comes to translating “A Study in Scarlet”.

7. “Grimizna nit”

„Grimizna nit“ is a translation of “A Study in Scarlet” by Domagoj Orlić, a philosopher and member of the Society of Croatian Literary Translators. This seems to be his only Doyle translation, his other works including a translation of Joseph Conrad’s novel *The Shadow Line* and several non-fiction books. Published in 2013, it is the most contemporary translation of the four, serving as an example of the current state of Sherlock translations.

One thing that all the translations have in common is that they approach the translation of the title differently. In the 2013 translation, the title references the scarlet *thread* (Doyle 60) rather than a *study* in scarlet. Additionally, “study” is not translated as “studija” like in the previous two translations. The translator chose “investigation” instead of “study”: “grimizna istraga” (45). Both the omission of “study” in the title and the change to “istraga” were probably done to avoid the previously discussed awkwardness surrounding the word “studija” in Croatian, especially as it could be confused as a synonym for the lexem “istraživanje” or “exploration”, which is not the case with “studija”. However, some of the meaning was also lost in this process, as the allusion to an art study is important to the understanding of Sherlock as a character and the way he approaches cases.

In terms of language, this translation seems to be a sort of middle ground between the 1908 and 1978 ones. While “Kasna osveta” might come across as archaic to contemporary readers as it was written over a hundered years ago, “Grimizna studija” eliminated this outdated language in order to make the text more approachable to its readers. “Grimizna nit”, on the other hand, generally sticks to contemporary language and forms like *perfekt*, while the *aorist* form is used in places to convey the feeling of the text taking place in the past (stigosmo, ušetah etc). This is particularly evident in Watson’s sections, as they are written in his voice and therefore more stylized, unlike the more neutral Part II written in the third person.

Additionally, some of the translations seem to be either regional terms or Turkish or Serbian loanwords, for example: “burma” (34) – used to differentiate “circle of plain gold” from simply “ring” (Doyle 43), “kandžija” instead of “bič” (44), “uobrazilja” instead of “mašta” (47).

Similarly to “Grimizna studija”, this translator also made an effort to adjust phrases to Croatian, rather than translate word for word. For example, “thin as a lath and as brown as a nut” (Doyle 8) becomes “Mršav si k’o prut a mrk k’o vuk” (10), “wants to take diggings” (Doyle 15) becomes “treba krov nad glavom” (15), “I am no chicken” (Doyle 41) becomes “nisam se jučer rodio” (33), “the old hound is the best” (Doyle 46) becomes “na koncu pobjeđuje iskustvo” (37) and so on. In the case of “sharp as needles” (Doyle 75), the translator chose to prioritize the needle metaphor rather than use the perhaps more common phrase “bistar kao suza”: “prodorni su poput igle” (55).

Another example of the translator adjusting the source text for contemporary Croatian readers are the translations of measurements. While measurement units like feet were left as “stopa” in the older two translations, this translation converted them to centimetres, the actual units used today in Croatia. Examples include “sto osamdeset centimetara” (38) for six feet and “sto trideset i pet centimetara” (40) for four and a half feet.

Moreover, the translator also seems to have noticed that Croatian readers might not recognize some of London’s landmarks, which are only mentioned by name in the story. To remedy this he uses addition, one of the strategies of transferring cultural elements, which can be described as the inclusion of information not present in the source into the target text (Littlejohn, Rao Metha 56). Take, for example, “bolnica Bart” (10), “ulica Brixton road” and “ulica Strand” (35) where the source text only mentions Bart’s, Brixton road and Strand.

In other aspects, however, the influence of English is very evident in the translation. In particular, some of the sentence structures were transferred directly from the English source text. In "Pokušavam riješiti problem je li moguće pronaći udoban stan po toj cijeni" (11), for example, the "Trying to solve the problem as to whether (…)" (Doyle 8) structure from the source is kept in the translation, making for an awkward sentence in Croatian. Similarly, "Sama njegova osobnost i pojava bile su takve da su privlačile pažnju" (18) can be traced back to "were such as to strike the attention" (Doyle 19). While this is not incorrect, however, it could have also been simplified to "privlačile su pažnju", which would draw less attention to the fact that it is a translation. Another example is the phrase "an enthusiast in some branches of science" (Doyle 9), which was translated as "entuzijast je u nekim granama znanosti" (11). Rather than using the preposition "in", the more natural sounding option in Croatian might be a structure with the noun in genitive case. Moreover, while "grana znanosti" is not incorrect, "znanstvena grana" is more commonly used. Further examples include "Toliko sablastan bio je dojam" (46) for "So sinister was the impression" (61) and "S mnogo promrmljanih blagoslova" (51) for "With many mumbled blessings" (Doyle 68).

Another unique aspect of this translation is that the translator attempts to convey the idiolects of certain characters. The constable John Rance, for example, speaks with a bit of a Cockney accent, which signals him being a lower class than Sherlock and Watson's standard English. Examples where this is evident include "I was a-strollin" (Doyle 56), "I ain't afeard of anything on this side o' the grave" (Doyle 56) and "Where was you hid to see all that?" (Doyle 57). It does not seem that the translator chose one specific dialect of Croatian to represent the Cockney accent, but rather used some general informal, shortened forms to convey it: "Šet'o sam ulicom (43), "pjev'o je na sav glas o Kolumbininom novom stijegu il' o tak' nečem" (44). Young Lucy Ferrier, on the other hand, seems to be speaking with a Southern US accent: "she 'most always did if she was just goin' over to auntie's for tea" (Doyle 104),

“Ain’t there no water nor nothing to eat?” (Doyle 104). The translator approaches this the same way as with John Rance – no specific Croatian dialect is used, parts of it are instead rewritten to vernacular speech “ak’ bi o’šla tetici na čaj” (77). It should also be noted that in both of these examples, not every instance of cockney or southern accent is turned informal on a one-to-one basis. “Where was you hid”, for instance, is translated as “Gdje ste bili”, which is regular standard Croatian. In other words, the translator took an inconsistently liberal approach, adding the markings of the accents when he could, but not forcing it in places where it did not fit.

Another example of this translation aiming to be more accessible to contemporary Croatian readers are the translations of the French and Latin phrases in the story, which remain untranslated in the other two translations. Take, for example, the final line of the book: “Populus me sibilat, at mah plaudo ipse domi simuli ac nummos contemplate in arca”, which was translated in the footnotes as “Svijet me ogovara, a ja sam sebi plješćem. I u svojoj škrinji prebrojavam blago.” (135). However, this does bring up the question of whether instances of another foreign language should be translated at all.

Some mistakes from the previous translations, such as the curious case of Ivanka Hones, are not repeated in this translation. Moreover, as this translation was written in a period in which detective fiction and the terms associated with it were already established, “clue” is no longer “ključ” but “trag” (56), while “deduction” is “dedukcija” (17). There are, however, some minor mistakes in the translation: for example, incorrect punctuation marks and some misspellings – “pogodilo me kao grob” (127).

* * *

To sum up, “Grimizna nit” is representative of the current state of Sherlockian translation. Where previously the translations were largely reliant on German, this one wears the influences of English on its sleeve. This is particularly obvious in the direct translations of

sentence structures such as “as to whether” and “were such as to” discussed earlier. At the same time, it attempts to be more “reader friendly” by translating phrases meaning-for-meaning, adjusting measurement units, providing additional information on places in London for those who may not be aware of them, and translating French and Latin phrases from the text in the footnotes. In the process, it risks translating too much at times, like in the instance of the omission of “study” from the title, which dilutes some of the symbolism of the term. Overall, while it has its flaws, it is a worthy modern-day translation, certain to satisfy the average contemporary reader.

8. Conclusion

Doyle's character of Sherlock Holmes has inspired wonder and amazement since he was introduced for the very first time, not only due to his genius, but also because he returned a sense of justice and security into violence-filled Victorian London. No wonder that readers from all over the world wanted to hear the story, preferably in their own language.

Soon, it gained so much popularity that publishers started adding fake Doyle stories into the same collections as regular ones in an attempt to profit. However, these editions were often translated as carelessly as they were published. "Kasna osveta", for example, includes many careless mistakes, is inconsistent in its translations of certain terms, borrows many German structures, and is not yet sure how to translate detective fiction staples such as "clues" and "deductions". "Späte Rache", published in a way similar to "Kasna osveta", omits so much from the source material that even the title had to be changed. Later, "Grimizna studija" fixes many of the mistakes from "Osveta", but also includes new mistakes, terms which would today be considered outdated and/or are a result of the Yugoslavia-era language unification. "Grimizna nit" functions well as a contemporary translation, but this time it is the influence of the English language that is most distracting.

When comparing these three translations not only to the source text, but also to each other, it becomes apparent that every translation is, at the end of the day, a product of its time. Each translation is a showcase of what the target language looked like in that specific moment, and what languages it was most influenced by: during the publishing of "Kasna osveta", it was German; when "Studija" came out, its influence was significantly smaller; and with "Nit" it is all English. Throughout the translations we can also observe the role of the translator becoming more and more respected. At first, no translators were credited at all, then they were credited

but not much information about them was provided and available, and finally we see professional translators who are members of translation associations.

In the end, each of the translations tells its own story and has its place in the history of Sherlock Holmes.

Works cited

Clausen, Christopher. "Sherlock Holmes, Order, and the Late-Victorian Mind." *The Georgia Review*, vol. 38, no. 1, 1984, pp. 104–23, www.jstor.org/stable/41398643

Conan, Doyle. "Conan Doyle's Best Books in Three Volumes: A Study in Scarlet and Other Stories." *P.F. Collier & Son*, 1904. HathiTrust Digital Library, www.babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc1.b4107807&view=1up&seq=1&skin=2021&q1=consulting%20detective

Conan, Doyle. "Kasna osveta": *Detektiv Sherlock Holmes i njegovi znameniti doživljaji*. Serija, svezak. Zagreb: Akademska knjižara Gjure Trpinca, 1908. Digitized edition.

Conan, Doyle. "Späte Rache". *Sherlock Holmes Serie I.* Projekt Gutenberg, Digitized edition, 1902. https://www.projekt-gutenberg.org/doyle/spaete/titlepage.html

Conan, Doyle. "Grimizna studija, Znak četvorice". Zagreb: Alfa, 1987.

Conan, Doyle. "Grimizna nit." Labin: Mathias Flacius, 2013.

"Detektiv Sherlock Holmes i njegovi znameniti doživljaji" *The Arthur Conan Doyle Encyclopedia.* www.arthur-conan-doyle.com/index.php?title=Detektiv_Sherlock_Holmes_I_njegovi_znameniti_do%C5%BEivljaji

Fillingham, Lydia Alix. "'The Colorless Skein of Life': Threats to the Private Sphere in Conan Doyle's A Study in Scarlet." *ELH*, vol. 56, no. 3, 1989, pp. 667–88, www.doi.org/10.2307/2873202

Lecourt, Sebastian. “The Mormons, the Victorians, and the Idea of Greater Britain.” *Victorian Studies*, vol. 56, no. 1, 2013, pp. 85–111, www.doi.org/10.2979/victorianstudies.56.1.85

Littlejohn, Andrew and Rao Mehta, Sandhya, eds. *Language studies. Stretching the Boundaries.* Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2012. Procedures for Translating Culturally Specific Items (pp. 43-61).

McConnell, Frank D. “Sherlock Holmes: Detecting Order Amid Disorder.” *The Wilson Quarterly* (1976-), vol. 11, no. 2, 1987, pp. 172–83, www.jstor.org/stable/40257858

Primorac, Antonija. 3. “For an Anti-Atlas of World Literature: The Case of Sherlock Holmes and his Doppelgänger”. In: *Anti-Atlas: Towards a Critical Area Studies*. Eds. Tim Beasley-Murray, Wendy Bracewell, Michał Murawski. London: University College London Fringe Press, 2022 (forthcoming).

Sims, Michel. *Arthur & Sherlock: Conan Doyle and the Creation of Holmes*. London: Bloomsbury, 2016.

Sweeney, Susan Elizabeth. “The Magnifying Glass: Spectacular Distance in Poe's “Man of the Crowd” and Beyond”. *Poe Studies/Dark Romanticism*, vol. 36, 2003, pp. 3-17, www.doi.org/10.1111/j.1754-6095.2003.tb00146.x

Rječnik hrvatskoga ili srpskoga jezika, Opseg 3, Dio 2. Zagreb: Jugoslavenska akademija znanosti i umjetnosti, 1890. Digitized edition. https://books.google.hr/books?id=HU5HAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA508&dq=gusla%C4%8D&hl=hr&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwid-5i23KL6AhUE_KQKHa0iBJUQ6AF6BAgpEAI#v=onepage&q&f=false

“Die Fortschritte der Physik”. Berlin: Druck und Verlag von Georg Reimer, 1876. Digitized edition. https://books.google.hr/books?id=mUk-AQAAMAAJ&pg=PA21&dq=salzseestadt&hl=hr&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjpjOa746D6AhVJCuwKHT1rCNYQ6AF6BAgGEAI#v=onepage&q&f=false

“Die Allgemeine Auswanderungszeitung”. Rudolfstadt: Berlagebuchhandlung, 1864. Digitized edition https://books.google.hr/books?id=eM1BAAAAcAAJ&pg=RA1-PA125&dq=Salzseestadt&hl=hr&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwj88Jyh6qL6AhWmg_0HHcZeDpIQ6AF6BAgMEAI#v=onepage&q&f=false

“Wortbildung: Komposita” Deutsche Welle. https://learngerman.dw.com/de/wortbildung-komposita/l-40402205/gr-40405741

“What’s an art study?” Robert Lyn Nelson’s Fine Art Studio – Artist’s Official Site. www.robertlynnelson.com/whats-an-art-study/

“Gusle” Hrvatski jezični portal. https://hjp.znanje.hr/index.php?show=search_by_id&id=fV5mXBA%3D